

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ELECTRONIC APPROVAL - 09/04/2020 - RL



THE NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 CENTRE STREET 9TH FLOOR NORTH NEW YORK NY 10007
TEL: 212 669-7700 FAX: 212 669-7780



ADVISORY REPORT

ISSUE DATE: 09/4/2020	EXPIRATION DATE: 2/11/2026	DOCKET #: LPC-20-06726	CRA CRA-20-06726
ADDRESS: ROOSEVELT ISLAND		BOROUGH: MANHATTAN	BLOCK/LOT: 1373 / 1
Roosevelt Island Lighthouse Lighthouse, Roosevelt Island, Individual Landmark			

To the Mayor, the Council, and the President & CEO, Roosevelt Island Operating Company,

This report is issued pursuant to Section 25-318 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, which requires a report from the Landmarks Preservation Commission for plans for the construction, reconstruction, alteration, or demolition of any improvement or proposed improvement which is owned by the City or is to be constructed upon property owned by the City and is or is to be located on a landmark site or in a historic district or which contains an interior landmark.

February 11, 2020, following the Public Hearing of the same date, voted to issue a positive Commission Advisory Report for the proposed work at the subject premises.

The proposal, as approved, consists of demolishing the existing cast iron decagonal lantern house and constructing a new black-finished metal-framed octagonal lantern house, recalling the form of the original design and featuring clear glass panels at the body and opaque black glass panels at the roof, as shown in a digital presentation, titled "Lighthouse, Lighthouse Park, Roosevelt Island, NY" dated March 3, 2020 and prepared by Thomas A. Fenniman Architect, including 9 slides, consisting of photographs, drawings, and photomontages, all presented as components of the application at the Public Hearing and Public Meeting.

In reviewing this proposal, the Commission noted that the Roosevelt Island Lighthouse Individual Landmark Designation Report describes the Roosevelt Island Lighthouse as a lighthouse designed by James Renwick, Jr. and built in 1872 with later alterations. The Commission further noted that the project is subject to review by the State Officer for Historic Preservation.

With regard to this proposal, the Commission found that the replacement of the existing lantern house is warranted by the deteriorated condition of the existing cast iron components; that the original eight-sided lantern house was replaced by the extant ten-sided generic U. S. Coast Guard design in the 1920s, which is not consistent with the geometry of the eight-sided lighthouse tower; and that the proposed contemporary

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ELECTRONIC APPROVAL - 09/04/2020 - RL

interpretation of the lantern house will better recall the shape and form of the original lantern house. Based

on these findings, the Commission determined the work to be appropriate to the building and voted to issue a positive report with the recommendation that the details and the reflectivity of the opaque glass panels be further studied.

The Commission authorized the issuance of a positive Commission Advisory Report upon receipt, review and approval of signed and sealed Department of Building filing drawings showing the approved design.

Subsequently, on August 3, 2020, the Commission received filing drawings labeled T-001.00, G-001.00, G-002.00, and A-001.00 through A-600.00, all dated August 3, 2020, prepared by Thomas A. Fenniman, RA; drawings labeled S-100.00 through S-202.00 and E-100.00 through E-102.00, all dated June 24, 2020, prepared by Michelle Denise Noris, PE; and an email dated September 3, 2020, prepared by Samuel Harris, RA, and submitted as components of this application.

Accordingly, the Commission staff reviewed the submitted materials, noting that the filing drawings include supplemental documentation, including a study of the reflectivity of the opaque glass panels compared with painted sheet metal and painted cast iron. The Commission staff further noted that these materials include additional work at and adjacent to the octagonal tower, consisting of replacing the deteriorated 1920s concrete observation deck and supporting brackets and the black-painted metal railings with a reinforced concrete belt cap supporting a black-painted metal observation deck, brackets, and railings, recalling the historic design except that the railings will be taller; installing sixteen (16) concealed LED light fixtures at the underside of the observation deck; replacing two (2) modern glazed panels at the tower windows with metal-framed glazed panels featuring black-painted metal trefoil trim, recalling the historic design; temporarily removing and reinstalling the black-painted metal door, in conjunction with removing the bottom 6" section, constructing a new raised concrete floor, and installing a new bluestone threshold; installing a missing inscribed bluestone plaque above the entrance, secured with concealed steel fasteners; repointing gneiss masonry; repairing gneiss masonry with a cementitious patching compound; replacing damaged sections of gneiss elements with in-kind replacement units (Dutchmen); work at the areaway, including lifting and resetting bluestone pavers and gneiss curbs, matching the historic radial pattern; replacing deteriorated bluestone pavers with salvaged and new bluestone pavers (as needed) in-kind; replacing a deteriorated bluestone curb in-kind; resecuring loose gneiss curbs; replacing eight (8) recessed light fixtures at the bluestone pavers with smaller light fixtures located slightly closer to the tower; replacing four (4) black-painted metal drains in-kind; removing a modern metal plaque on a low limestone plinth; removing a modern metal sign and post; temporarily removing two (2) gneiss posts and reinstalling them in a slightly realigned location, in conjunction with replacing modern cast stone paving; and interior alterations at all floors.

With regard to this additional work, the Commission finds that certain aspects of the work are in accordance with the provisions set forth in Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-11 for Repair, Restoration, Replacement, and Re-creation of Building Facades and Related Exterior Elements, including Section 2-11(c)(3) for pointing mortar joints; Section 2-11(c)(4) for repair of natural or cast stone; Section 2-11(d)(1)(i) for in-kind material replacement; and Section 2-11(f) for re-creation and restoration of missing façade features; and Section 2-17 for Front, Side, and Rear Yards, including Section 2-17(a)(2) for areaway paving, steps, or planted areas. Furthermore, with regards to these or other aspects of the work, the Commission finds that the height of the observation platform railings will comply with safety regulations; that the size of the railings will be harmonious with the size of the observation deck and lantern house; that shortening the modern entrance door will facilitate the construction of a raised threshold and floor which will help protect the building from damage due to flooding; that the light fixtures at the observation deck will be small and not highly visible; that the light fixtures at the areaway

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ELECTRONIC APPROVAL - 09/04/2020 - RL
will be smaller than the existing light fixtures, and the work will not detract from the building or the historic district. Additionally, staff found that the design approved by the Commission has been maintained and the study of the reflectivity of the opaque glass panels has been submitted. Based on these and the above findings, the drawings have been marked approved and Commission Advisory Report 20-06727 is being issued.

The approved documents, and Department of Buildings filing drawings where applicable, are marked approved by the Commission, with the date of the approval indicated.

Please see Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York for complete text of any cited Rule section(s): <http://www1.nyc.gov/site/lpc/applications/rules-guides.page>

SAMPLES REQUIRED: Pursuant to Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-11(b)(5) and 2-11(b)(7) for Repair, Restoration, Replacement and Re-creation of Building Façades and Related Exterior Elements, this permit is being issued contingent upon the Commission's review and approval of installed sample mockups of replacement gneiss, bluestone, and mortar; and gneiss patching at locations requiring repair, prior to the commencement of work. Review instructions in the subsection cited above before preparing samples. Submit clear, color digital photographs of all samples to RLowry@lpc.nyc.gov for review, or contact staff to schedule a site visit.

This report is issued on the basis of the building and/or site conditions described in the application and disclosed during the review process. By accepting this report, the applicant agrees to notify the Commission if the actual building or site conditions vary or if original or historic architectural fabric is discovered. The Commission reserves the right to amend or revoke this report, upon written notice to the applicant, in the event that the actual building or site conditions are materially different from those described in the application or disclosed during the review process.

The reviewed documents, and Department of Buildings filing drawings where applicable, are marked as reviewed by the Commission, with the date of the review indicated. Other work or amendments to this filing must be reviewed separately. A copy of this report must be prominently displayed at the site while work is in progress. Please direct inquiries to Richard Lowry.



Sarah Carroll
Chair

PLEASE NOTE: REVIEWED DOCUMENTS, DEPARTMENT OF BUILDINGS FILING DRAWINGS WHERE APPLICABLE, AND A COPY OF THIS REPORT HAVE BEEN PROVIDED TO:

cc: Jared Knowles, Deputy Director; Thomas A. Feniman, Thomas A. Feniman Architect